Best Practices in Multicultural Supervision in Counseling

Caroline Fernandes
Mercer University

W. David Lane
Mercer University

Follow this and additional works at: https://egrove.olemiss.edu/jcrp

Part of the Counseling Psychology Commons, and the Counselor Education Commons

Best Practices in Multicultural Supervision in Counseling

Caroline Fernandes
W. David Lane
Mercer University

Abstract

The latest U.S. Census Bureau listed an increase in ethnic and racial diversity in the United States. Contributing to this are the growing statistics of refugees and immigrants whose intrapersonal experiences vary from the mainstream culture. Considering this growth, it is vital that counseling supervisors are aware of various cultures, ethnicity, social, and spiritual experiences of supervisees in training in order to provide ethical and competent supervision. This paper discusses supervisory issues, directions and trends, social justice issues, and the use of technology in multicultural supervision.

As monitored by the U.S. Census Bureau (2019), there is an immense increase in ethnic and racial diversity compared to the 1990's. This growth is projected to continue through the year 2060. As of the year 2018, approximately 327 million individuals resided in the United States, with Caucasians representing 76.6% of the total population, followed by Hispanic/Latino (18.1%), African American (13.4%), Asian (5.8%), biracial/multiracial (2.7%), and American Indian/Alaska Native (1.3%) individuals. This U.S. population census is projected to grow 78.2 million with a spike in multiracial and multi-ethnic births (Vespa et al., 2018). Considering these statistics, it is imperative that supervisors and supervisees in the counseling profession pay attention to their intrapersonal and interpersonal worldviews, beliefs, values, biases, and prejudices as they continue to work in the mental health profession (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014). Whether overtly or covertly acknowledged, race and ethnic identities are sensitive topics in the western society which need to be addressed within the supervisor-supervisee relationship. Culturally competent counselors address the cultural differences between the supervisor and supervisee to effectively strengthen their alliance (Matthews et al., 2018). With multicultural racial and ethnic awareness comes awareness of other complex issues such as sexual minority, gender issues, disability, and issues of religion and spirituality, this would help prevent clouding one's decision-making skills and avoid relying on stereotyped generalizations regarding racial-multicultural groups (Tomlinson-Clarke, 2013).

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Caroline Fernandes, College of Professional Advancement, Mercer University, 3001 Mercer University Drive, Atlanta, GA 30341. Email: fernandes_cm@mercer.edu

Counselor supervision is a critical component in the continuous development of counselors' clinical skills: case conceptualization, professional identity, and therapeutic skills, including documentation and establishing ethical guidelines (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014). Therefore, it is important for supervisors to be cognizant of diverse supervisee's historical and current cultural experiences also their worldviews in order to facilitate professional growth and development (Sue & Sue, 2016). In a study Chao (2013) suggests in order for effectiveness of multicultural competencies to increase awareness, multicultural training approaches need to be based on the trainees' racial-ethnic backgrounds and experiences.

Awareness of Multicultural Competency in Supervision

Addressing multicultural concerns in supervision respects diversity and personal experience so that the supervisor can bring out the best in the supervisee.
For example, if the supervisee is a multiracial immigrant female of color with a diverse multicultural and spiritual background who has experienced sexual and religious oppression, it would be necessary in training to validate the supervisee's intrapersonal experiences including ethnic and intrapersonal dimension of identity from her worldview (Fackling et al., 2019). As stated in the Association for Counselor Supervision and Education Task Force Report (ACES, 2019), in order to prevent ethical violation or harm to supervisees, supervisors need to be culturally competent and extra cautious of microaggression,

microinvalidation, dismissive behavior, sexism, including insensitivity towards other cultures, ethnic experiences, and identity.

Moreover, it is also important for supervisors to be aware of and recognize those cultural and social norms in which educators/mentors are highly respected and trusted and seen as the expert. Supervisees from such cultures would honor guidance and mentorship by being submissive and obedient without questioning (Evans et al., 2014). If unchecked, this would add to the disproportion of power (Popejoy et al., 2020). Tomlinson-Clarke and Clark (2013, p. 4) emphasized that besides multicultural training and self-reflections to assess biases, it is important to immerse oneself in ongoing cross-cultural interactions to cultivate multicultural knowledge and cultural empathy so that helping professions recognize universal commonalities and develop appreciation for cultural uniqueness. In addition, to consider appropriate diagnosis, supervisors would need to identify and understand cultural and individual characteristics that define specific personality and life experience (Tomlinson-Clarke, 2014).

Multicultural Issues in Supervision

Considering the growing multicultural and racial-ethnic population in the United States, it is vital for supervisors to be competent in counseling clients who are different from themselves. This will help with supervising those who are culturally different. This is especially relevant when concerns, such as stereotyping and

microaggression, or insensitivity to cultures, especially those that are not mainstream and have an undertone of intercultural variations, arise in supervision so that supervisors are fully aware and recognize when supervisees demonstrate mixed cultural values or upbringing (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014). Sue and Sue (2016), postulate the importance of multicultural competency to prevent clients from prematurely terminating counseling sessions when they feel their counselors are not able to effectively relate to their cultural values. In this case, it is easier for clients to terminate because they have the autonomy to do so, however, in the case of supervisor-supervisee relationships, it would not be that easy to terminate supervision because "the supervisee may feel obligated to continue an unsatisfactory supervisory relationship" (Fickling et al., 2019, p. 309) due to sensitive licensure documentation and State Board required strategic paperwork. Navigating these supervisor-supervisee conflict could become stressful for the supervisee due to differential of power, since the supervisor has the authority to decide whether or not the supervisee is competent to be fully licensed. Due to these insecurities, supervisees may hesitate to voluntarily terminate supervision (Glosoff & Durham, 2010). Hence, understanding the power differential in supervision, discussing differences, acknowledging cultural differences, and seeking appropriate training to bridge the gap, if any, is the responsible ethical best practice on the supervisor's part (Colistra & Brown-Rice, 2011).

Supporting this theory, Sue and Sue (2016) point out the dangers of how some graduate programs, in failing to address the issue of multicultural competency in counselor education, continue to produce inadequate supervisors who are ill-equipped to facilitate learning or the treatment of mental health issues for people of color. This observation would potentially be directed towards counseling programs that are not accredited by the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Education Programs (CACREP). CACREP accreditation acts as a watchdog for academic gatekeeping in counselor education. CACREP standards emphasize the importance of thorough training in cultural competence to maintain a safe environment, conducive to learning, which supports development of professional identity, including strict standards for evaluation, practicum, and internship experiences (Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Education Programs [CACREP], 2019). Considering the influx of refugees and immigrants into the United States, cultural competency would not only benefit clients but would assist in keeping counseling students and supervisees safe as they learn to explore their strengths and vulnerability in counseling programs. Multicultural issues and cross-cultural issues in counseling supervision should be a priority for inclusion of supervisees from all walks of life.

Multicultural Issues Addressed by Counseling Supervisors

According to Bernard and Goodyear (2014), supervisors are responsible for assuring that multicultural issues receive attention in supervision. It is the supervisor's responsibility to educate themselves and to address any minority groups, clients, and/or supervisee concerns that may arise (Flickling et al., 2019). Also, it is the supervisor's responsibility to ensure similarities and "myth of sameness" (Bernard & Goodyear, 1992, p. 195) do not overshadow their evaluation process or undermine cultural concerns of those different than them. Supervisors should be equipped to assist ethnic and minority supervisees by attending to their ethical and cultural concerns (ACES, 2011, p. 8). As stated by the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision Task Force (ACES, 2019), it is essential that educator, supervisors, and counselors are competent in the services they provide. The ACA Code of Ethics (2014) clearly states that supervisors must have multicultural awareness and understand the effect it has on supervisee-supervisor relationship, and that supervisors must avoid ignorance of intercultural and multicultural differences in supervision by educating themselves to be inclusive and not rely on supervisees to "bear the burden" to educate them (Fickling et al., 2019). Ignoring cultural differences in supervision is equivalent to harming the supervisor, supervisee, and client relationship triad (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014).

According to Erickson-Cornish et al. (2010), multiculturally challenging issues that may arise in supervision may take the form of unintentional "isms" and biases, overemphasizing/ underemphasizing cultural exploration during assessment, and insensitivity to supervisee's nonverbal cues and hesitation to speak. On the other hand, there are many multicultural opportunities in supervision, such as establishing mutual trust, empathy, increase in intrapersonal and interpersonal processing, and awareness of social justice and advocacy, that could contribute to supervisees' growth and development (Colistra & Brown-Rice, 2011). Supervisors could also benefit from pursuing intrinsic experiences to improve their lack of awareness (Flickling et al., 2019).

Multicultural and Social Justice Issues

Manivong et al. (2015), stress the need for multicultural competency among counselors to evolve as society evolves due to the increasing need for social justice of the culturally diverse and marginalized clients. It is crucial to recognize the need of social justice when providing multicultural education and supervision to disenfranchised population as it is the supervisor's responsibility to be current with sociopolitical influences that impact marginalized and privileged supervisees (Flickling et al., 2019). Infusing social justice into counselor education from the beginning would be a productive format to help future counselors establish a sense of community and develop successful counseling relationships with clients and

supervisors (Decker et al., 2016; Mitcham et al., 2013). Ceballos et al. (2012), specify that empathy for human suffering and understanding is achieved when social justice is incorporated into clinical counseling. A holistic perspective during case conceptualizations helps one understand what it means to walk in someone else's shoes which includes not only assessing affective, behavioral, cognitive, and emotional development but instead viewing circumstantial problems to remove potential oppressive environmental barriers (Lewis, 2011). Furthermore, following the ACA framework would also help supervisors to better understand the multicultural, sociopolitical, religious, economic, and systemic factors that contribute to the microcosm of their supervisees (Fickling et al., 2019).

Multicultural Issues and Cyber Supervision

The increasing use of technology in higher education and the recent COVID-19 pandemic has dramatically increased the need for cyber-supervision, "a clinical supervision of psychological services using digital tools through a synchronous audio-video format in which the supervisor is not located in the same physical location as the trainee" (Nadan et al., 2020, p. 998; Pennington et al., 2019). Research using Asynchronous (online at different times) cyber-supervision and synchronous (live online supervision) cyber-supervision has shown to promote critical thinking, inclusion, lower supervisees' anxiety, and increase a psychological sense of safety and

confidence (Bender & Dykeman, 2016). During the COVID-19 pandemic online counseling and supervision has helped extend mental health support and continued supervision (Nadan et al., 2020).

Technology promotes learning and understanding of intersectionality and cultural phenomenology which stretches beyond geographical location and classrooms (Meekums et al., 2017; Pennington et al., 2019). Technology can be the bridge that creates intercultural understanding and growth; however, both supervisors and supervisees need to be cognizant of telemental health counseling ethics and ensure that professional ethical guidelines, best practices and laws are respectfully implemented (Herlihy & Corey, 2006). An additional benefit of using synchronous cyber supervision is the ability to invite competent multicultural supervisors as adjuncts into the training, allowing the supervisor to simultaneously observe and provide synchronous feedback to supervisees without interrupting the active therapeutic process (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014; Nadan et al., 2020).

In an experiential study using PractiZoom, a Zoom cyber supervision platform for practicum students, the emphasis of the study was to provide uninterrupted therapy for families during COVID-19. The Marriage and Family counseling supervisors of Barcai Institute in Israel, reported successful training and learning opportunities for their students where online ethical guidelines were clearly implemented and privacy of clients

maintained. All participants, including senior educators who were new to cyber supervision expressed positive satisfaction of this experience as use of the cyber platform was empowering and non-intrusive (Nadan et al., 2020).

Best Practices in Multicultural Supervision

Best practices guidelines, based on evidence, provide valuable and ethical implications for supervisory competencies (Borders, 2014). The ACES Task Force report (2019) clearly states that supervisors should explore their cultural identity, values, beliefs, including issues of power and privilege with regards to counseling and supervision. Supervisors are to keep up with the latest research, scholarly literature, social, and political issues to stay relevant with current topics impacting supervisees and their clients. Code 6: a; Diversity and Advocacy Considerations (ACES, 2019), also mandates that "supervisors should recognize that all supervision is multicultural supervision" (p. 8) and that in the initial supervision session supervisors should address "issues of culture, diversity, power, and privilege" within the supervisor-supervisee counseling relationships (Guideline 6: Diversity and Advocacy; a.i., p. 8). Best practice for multicultural guidelines also includes encouraging "supervisees to raise difficult topics pertaining to social advocacy issues" to enforce open discussion and screen for explicit or implicit biases that may potentially hinder the therapeutic process (Guideline 11: The Supervisor, p. 13).

Supervisors should partake in continuing education classes focused on multicultural competency, regularly self-evaluate using the Multicultural Supervision Scale, and, when in doubt, be open and willing to consult with peers whenever necessary (Guideline 11: The Supervisor, p. 13).

Conclusion

There is no denying the face of this country has forever changed. The growth of immigrant, refugee, international students, and professional populations has contributed to the growing complexity of multiracial, multicultural, and multiethnic issues. Other issues such as physical disability, emotional, and mental health issues, need to be treated with the same awareness as multicultural issues (Colistra & Brown-Rice, 2011). The emergence of recent socio-political, racial-ethnic, social advocacy, including the growing trend of "cancel culture", where one is "canceled" or "unsupported" for their opposing viewpoint (Douglas, 2019), has forever changed the trajectory of our country. Awareness of mental health issues and the need to support multicultural mental health for minorities is rapidly growing and highlights the gap in multicultural training and development in the counseling field during this time.

Moving forward, it is imperative that graduate programs focus on inclusion and intentionally train counseling students by challenging their biases and limitations and encouraging cross cultural immersion early in the process (Barden et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke, 2013; Fickling et al.,

2019). Supervisors should encourage supervisees to go deeper and explore their intrapersonal biases in order to strengthen their interpersonal relationships with clients and their professional peers (Sue & Sue, 2016). Supervisors need to increase gatekeeping to assess clinical impairment for those who resist professional and personal growth (Glance et al., 2012). Creating CACREP accredited core courses on social justice and advocacy early on in the Master's counseling education program would enhance student's awareness and promote students to be informed and ready for their practicum and internship rather than being unprepared with inadequate or limited training (Ceballos et al., 2012).

The growing awareness of multiculturalism and diversity in the United States signals a need to modify our existing cultural lens and refocus attention on professional behavior development that is holistic and inclusive. Eliminating the existing ill-prepared mental health professionals, who were the direct result of a culture-bond and biased training system (Sue & Sue, 2016), would be a great start toward a constructive direction in training mental health professionals who are inclusive and socially connected. Understanding that evidence-based practices may not always work with diverse cultural minority groups, but also understanding that they do provide a network of information one may select from and modify for implementation when needed. Considering the upward trajectory of multicultural, multiracial, and multiethnic growth in western countries, it would be beneficial to

develop a synthesis of multicultural supervision models for mental health professions. Addressing intrapersonal challenges and making the covert overt would help professionals and the overall mental health system to shift, thereby creating a ripple effect of change within the political, socio-economic, educational, and spiritual paradigm of society. As discussed by Bender and Dykeman (2016), taking advantage of technology to bring the ancient knowledge of harmony and togetherness would help support a productive holistic lifestyle and would also support future generations.

References

American Counseling Association (2014). *ACA Code of Ethics. Alexandria*, VA.

Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (2019). ACES task force report: *Best Practices in Clinical Supervision.* https://www.acesonline.net/spam-notice

Barden, S. M., Mobley, K., & Shannonhouse, L. (2014). Cultural immersion in counselor education in the United States: A quasi experimental study. *Journal of International Counselor Education, 6,* 46-60.

Bender, S., & Dykeman, C. (2016). Supervisees' perceptions of effective supervision: A comparison of fully synchronous cyber-supervision to traditional methods. *Journal of Technology in Human Services*, *34*(4), 326–337. https://doi.org/10.1080/15228835.2016.1250026

Bernard, J.M. & Goodyear, R.K. (1992). *Fundamentals of Clinical Supervision.* llyn & Bacon.

Bernard, J. M. & Goodyear, R.K. (2014). *Fundamentals of Clinical Supervision* (5th ed.). NJ Pearson Education.

Borders, L. (2014). Best Practices in Clinical supervision: Another step in delineating effective supervision practice. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, *68*(2), 151–162. https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.psychotherapy.2014.68.2.151

Ceballos, P. L., Parikh, S., & Post, P. B. (2012). Examining social justice attitudes among play therapists: Implications for multicultural supervision and training. *International Journal of Play Therapy*, *21*(4), 232–243. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0028540

Colistra, A., & Brown-Rice, K. (2011). When the rubber hits the road: Applying multicultural competencies in cross-cultural supervision.

http://counselingoutfitters.com/vistas/vistas11/Article_43.pdf

Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Education Programs (2019). *Introduction to the 2016 CACREP Standards*. https://www.cacrep.org/introduction-to-the-2016-cacrep-standards/

Decker, K. M., Manis, A. A., & Paylo, M. J. (2016). Infusing social justice advocacy into counselor education: Strategies and recommendations. *Journal of Counselor Preparation & Supervision, 8*(3), 100. http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edo&AN=121020433&site=eds-live&scope=site

Erickson Cornish, J. A., Schreier, B. A., Nadkarni, L. I., Metzger, L. H., Henderson, & L.,Rodolfa, E. R. (2010). *Handbook of Multicultural Counseling Competencies* (1st ed.). John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Evans, E., F. Baskerville, R., Wynn-Williams, K., & J. Gillett, S. (2014). How students' ethnicity influences their respect for teachers. *Asian Review of Accounting, 22*(2), 159–178. https://doi.org/10.1108/ARA-01-2014-0001

Fickling, M., Tangen, J., Graden, M., & Grays, D. (2019). Multicultural and social justice competence in clinical supervision. *Counselor Education*

and Supervision, *58*(4), 309–316. https://doi.org/10.1002/ceas.12159

Glance, D., Fanning, G., Schoepke, A., Soto, W., & Williams, M. A. (2012). Gatekeeping in counselor education. *Vista 2014*. https://www.counseling.org/resources/library

Glosoff, H. & Durham, J. C. (2010). Using supervision to prepare social justice counseling advocates. *Counselor Education & Supervision*, *50*(2), 116–129. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6978.2010.tb00113.x

Herlihy, B. & Corey, G. (2006). *ACA Ethical Standards Casebook* (6th ed.). American Counseling Association.

Lewis, J., Ratts, M., Paladino, D., & Toporek, R. (2011). Social justice counseling and advocacy: developing new leadership roles and competencies. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*, *3*(1), 5–16. https://doi.org/10.33043/JSACP.3.1.5-16

Lopez, G., Ruiz, N. G., & Patten, E. (2017). Key facts about Asian Americans, a diverse and growing population. *Pew Research Center*. https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/09/08/key-facts-about-asian-americans/

Matthews, J. J., Mehta Barden, S., & Sherrell, R. S. (2018). Examining the relationships between multicultural counseling competence, multicultural self-efficacy, and ethnic identity development of practicing counselors. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, *40*(2), 129. https://doi-org.proxy-s.mercer.edu/10.17744/mehc.40.2.03

McDowell, T., Fang, S.-R., Kosutic, I., & Griggs, J. (2012). Centering the voices of international students in family studies and family therapy graduate programs. *Journal of Marital & Family Therapy*, *38*(Supp S1), 332–347. https://doi-org.proxy-s.mercer.edu/10.1111/j.1752-0606.2012.00310.x

Meekums, B., Wathen, C. C., & Koltz, R. L. (2017). Technology as a bridge: developing intercultural understanding through a counselling student videoconference. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, *45*(3), 238. https://doi.org/10.1080/03069885.2015.1135875

Mitcham, M., Greenidge, W., Smith, S. D. (2013). Teaching the multicultural counseling course: Facilitating courageous conversations and transformational multicultural pedagogy. *Vistas 2013*. https://www.counseling.org/docs/default-source/vistas

Sue, D. W. & Sue, D. (2016). *Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice*. Wiley Publication.

Tomlinson-Clarke, S. (2013). Multicultural counseling competencies: Extending multicultural training paradigms toward globalization. *Vistas 2013*. http://www.counseling.org/knowledge-center/vistas

Tomlinson-Clarke, S. M. & Clarke, D. L. (2013). Participants' reflections of short-term cultural immersion in South Africa. Manuscript submitted for publication.

Tomlinson-Clarke, S., & Georges, C. (2014). DSM-5: A commentary on integrating multicultural and strength-based considerations into counseling training and practice. *The Professional Counselor, 4*(3), 272–281. https://doi.org/10.15241/stc.4.3.272

U. S. Census Bureau (2019). Quick facts. https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045216/00

Vespa, J., Armstrong, D. M., & Medina, L. (2018). Demographic turning points for the United States: Population projections for 2020 to 2060. https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2018/demo/P25_1144.pdf